

Impact Factor- 8.174

Page no.- 244-253

The Strategy of Corona Virus Disease Pandemic-Post Education Service Policy at Primary Education Level in Salatiga, Central Java Province, Indonesia

Suwardi¹, Sri Risis Sugiyarti², Aehmad Choeruddin³

^{1,2,3} Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Slamet Riyadi Surakarta, Central Java, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
Published Online:	Long distance and face-to-face learning activities during corona virus disease -19 (Covid-19)
02 May 2023	pandemic have both positive and negative sides. In the future, post-pandemic education should be
	better. This research aims to deliver an alternative formulation of education service policy post-
	Covid-19 pandemic with new policy ecosystem approach. The education service policy model
	implemented in normal period is different from that in new normal (transition) and normal period
	before pandemic. The research was conducted in Salatiga Government, Central java, Indonesia as
	the authorized organizer of primary education. The data of research was collected from elementary
	(SD) and junior high schools (SMP) as the unit of analysis. The sample consisted of 14 elementary
	schools and 8 junior high schools. Interview and observation were the technique of collecting data
	used in this study. Data validation was carried out using source triangulation in forum group
	discussion. Considering the result of research, the author recommends the education service strategy
	to be implemented by Salatiga Government, Central Java, Indonesia i.e.: (1) a strategy combining
	strength and weakness of long distance and face-to-face learning; (2) the learning source should be
	expanded not limited to teacher's role domination only. More than that, learning sources obtained
Corresponding Author:	from internet media are broader and have varying packaging; and (2) standardization of the school's
Suwardi	role should be conducted dynamically building on science and technology development.
KEYWORDS: Strategy, service, education, post-pandemic, Covid-19	

INTRODUCTION

In the last two years, the organizers of education throughout world are faced with a reality that teachinglearning process cannot be implemented normally. Every day (weekday) teachers, teaching staff, students, and other supporting personnel go to school to implement teachinglearning activity. They come in group or individually cheerfully, assemble to study and to play together along the school hour. That occurred before World Health Organization (WHO) announced corona virus disease as global pandemic on March 11, 2020. In Indonesia, non-natural national disaster due to corona virus – 19 was announced by President Joko Widodo on Monday, March, 2 2020 as released by mass media. Following the announcement, various policies, including teaching-learning process at all educational institution levels, are organized not as usual.

During pandemic era, the learning process is organized online or called long distance learning until entering adaptation period in the last quarter of 2021. Ministry of Education and Culture (Indonesian: *Kementerian* Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, thereafter called Kemendikbud) published Circular Number 15 of 2020 about the Guidelines of School-from-home Implementation during Covid-19 Transmission Emergency Period. An Expert Staff of the Minister of Education and Culture for Regulation Division, Chatarina Muliana Girsang, delivered this Circular Number 15 to confirm the Minister of Education and Culture (Indonesian: Menteri Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, thereafter called Mendikbud) Number 4 of 2020 about the Implementation of Education during Coronavirus Disease (Covid-19) emergency period. As explained by the Ministry of Education's Officials, method and medium of schoolfrom-home implementation included Long Distance Learning divided into two approaches: online and offline long distance learning. "Long distance learning is school from home, including online, semi online, and offline (https://www.kemdikbud.go.id/main/blog/2020/05/kemendi kbud-terbitkan-pedoman-penyelenggaraan-belajar-dari-<u>rumah</u>)

This Ministry of Education policy, according to Dwiyogo (2010), is called *Blended learning*. It is the learning combining a face-to-face learning strategy, computer-based (offline), and online computer (internet and mobile learning. The implementation of*blended learning* method requires five main factors: (1) facility and infrastructure, (2) teachers that keep improving their ability by means of reading and practicing independently and through formal training, and (3) students needing access to computer and internet and having ability of utilizing E-learning (Kusairi, 2011).

Hoky (2012) states that school from home (SFH) is often called online-based (digital) learning, using means or network as its intermediary. Digital learning is a means of obtaining digital learning material, either online or offline, or a learning activity using wire-based or wireless network.

Sanjaya (2020) calls this long distance learning a distancing learning. The learning is done indirectly but face-to-face activity and communication are done through video conference, material, and assignment downloaded and uploaded through internet. Online learning is the one conducted online by utilizing technology and internet with *Google Meet, Zoom, Edmodo* and other learning applications.

Some educational observers suggest some terms to call online learning. Fitriyani (2020) explains that online learning is an innovation made in educational field by involving information technology in learning process (Fitriyani et al., 2020). Online learning or called e-learning will affect transformation of educational world from traditional (conventional) one using more lecturing and direct face-to-face methods into the digital (online) one, viewed from either system or content aspect (Mutia and Leonard, 2013). Adaptation period occurred after the invasion of delta variant covid-19 wave subsided around October to the end of 2021. All learning processes are implemented using long distance learning method combined with face-to-face learning. This learning pattern is called blended learning. Entering 2022, the Republic of Indonesia's Ministry of Education began to confidently apply face-to-face learning more broadly.

A study on the effect of digital learning conducted by Lin, M. H., Chen, H. C., & Liu, K. S. (2017) reported the strength and the weakness of online learning. The strengths of digital learning are, among others: student can learn flexibly and it can be done anytime and anywhere. The effects of digital learning are elaborated as follows: (a) digital learning affects learning motivation more positively than the traditional one does, (b) digital learning shows a better positive effect than the traditional one does, (c) learning motivation shows a positive significant effect on learning outcome, (d) learning motivation seems to have positive effect on learning gain. The weaknesses of digital-based learning are, among others: some students do not have adequate equipments such as smartphone, computer, Wi-Fi network or data package. Indonesia has not been ready yet for digital learning because some students are still living in inland where no network is available. Learning using digital learning method also results in anxiety related to the comprehension of material that will be learnt, and students accept and comprehend the material but cannot apply character education well, because teachers cannot know or control the students' character directly (Finanti and Marzuki (2020).

In an interview conducted in the beginning of research, a number of teachers in school, as suggested by the Official of Education Service Office of Salatiga City, Indonesia admit that this online learning is less effective compared with direct face to face learning for some reasons. *Firstly*, material content delivered using online method can unsurely be comprehended by all students. It is because this material content is presented in e-book form presented per chapter, powerpoint, and learning video format. The material may be comprehended, but students comprehend it incomprehensively. They comprehend it based on their interpretation or perspective. It can be seen from the actual experience, in which many students ask for further explanation on the material presented online via whatsapp chatting or calling the teachers directly.

Based on the experience with online teaching, this system is effective for giving assignment and quiz only. It means that when in a meeting students are given assignment/quiz, they will study the teaching material available in the application diligently and search for the material from other sources, so that "*anxiety*" arises when the assignment/quiz has not been completed. In contrast, if teacher posts material without assignment and the students are told to study it only, it will result in a different story.

Secondly, teacher has a limited ability of using technology in online learning. Not all teachers are able of operating computer or gadget to support learning activity, either face-to-face or moreover online. Some students indeed have been able to operate computer, but their ability is still limited. They cannot access internet network further, use various learning application, produce learning media/vide themselves and etc. Nevertheless, few teachers can master IT comprehensively can produce attractive learning video, and even become youtuber.

Thirdly, teachers have a limited control over the online learning implementation. It is because, among others, the application used does not present discussion forum menu to explain or to ask the material. Although the application provided such the menu, many students cannot utilize it well. In addition, in the beginning of learning process the students fill in presence list only but are not active until the learning time is up, as they go to do other activities out of the learning. However, undeniably some students actually participate actively until the end of learning, and some others participate actively but not fully until the end of learning.

Students have different perspectives in seeing the problems. Asmuni (2020) explains constraints and problems the students face in online learning. *Firstly*, the students participate less actively and are not interested in attending online learning, despite adequate supporting facilities including the availability of computer equipments, handphone/gadget, and internet network. Inadequate concern with the importance of literacy and portfolio assignment submission often inhibit the implementation of **School from Home** policy. The assignment that should be submitted within a week is often extended to two weeks.

Secondly, students do not have handphone/gadget set to be used as online learning media. Although they have them, they belong to be their parents. During online learning, they should use them in turn along with their parents, so that they take turn after their parents come home. Some parents come home in the afternoon, evening, and even at night. Meanwhile, generally online learning schedule is implemented from morning to afternoon.

Thirdly, a number of students live in the regions with no internet access. They cannot receive the assignment delivered by teachers through either whatsapp or cyber classroom. *Fourthly*, recalling the development of schoolfrom-home program have been running for about six months since the middle of March 2020, some students state that learning (school) from home too long make them lazy and is boring. In school learning, there are online and face-to-face learning types. Both online and face-to-face learning methods have their own strengths and weakness.

Compared with face-to-face learning before pandemic, the implementation of long distance learning has many positive effects on students. The Head of Educational Service Office of DKI Jakarta (Jakarta Capital-Specific Region) explains some positive effect of long distance learning including, among others: (1) Children have much time at home along with their family; (2) learning method is more varying compared with those at classroom, and they now learn from home more flexibly; (3) children are sensitive and adapt to the change; (4) children should willy-nilly explore technology; and (5) some students learn from home comfortably, as there is no one bullying them https://metro.tempo.co/read/1391861/dampak-negatif-danpositif-pembelajaran-jarak-jauh-selama-pandemi-covid-19.

Department of mathematic education of Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia (UPI: Indonesian Educational University)reported a positive finding on long distance learning during pandemic time, the development of technology-based education. This long distance learning system carries a concept of online school. Entire learning activity is conducted with technology. It requires everyone to participate in technology-literate learning process. Anyone participating in it will learn the importance of technology. Considering the importance of technological and digital literacy, there is acceleration in adopting Industrial Revolution 4.0 to Education in Indonesia (https://home.matematika.upi.edu/id/dampak-positifpembelajaran-jarak-jauh-oleh-aulia-alifeira-munandarmatematika-fpmipa-upi/).

The experience with school learning with class system has been gotten before pandemic. During Covid-19 pandemic in 2020 the learning was implemented using long distance learning model. In late 2021 to early 2022, blended learning model was adopted. After pandemic period, it will not be prudent to go back fully to the learning system pattern before pandemic. The hard valuable experience with school learning should generate some improvement in learning system, method, and procedure.

Recalling its title, this current study combines two basic concepts: policy strategy and service. These two concepts are applied to the educational research in regional government.

Werner Jann and Kai Wegricch (2015) explain the formulation of policy by elaborating various data and information around a situational problem and eventually recommend an alternative to correct the problem raised in the policy agenda. The alternative policy formulation takes consequence aspect into account as the tradeoff of the best possibility in the future. The policy selected to solve problems encountered is dependent on two factors. Firstly, policy should be a valid means of solving problem most efficiently and reasonably. An effective formulation involves analysis and alternative identification to solve problem. Secondly, policy should be reasonable politically. It is usually accomplished through building majority in bargaining process. Therefore, the policy formulation consists of an analysis identifying the most effective political policy and authorization. Thus, policy formulation should consider two basic points. The formulation often gives policy makers some option to solve the items of agenda; and the effective policy formulation should consist of an analysis identifying the most effective political policy and authorization. Therefore, the policy formulation should consider the existence of policy makers, those participating in policy formulation, particularly politicians, lobbyists, and activists.

Dunn (2007) explains that the technique of formulating alternative policy can be implemented in two stages. **Firstly**, analyst identifies as many as possible alternative means of achieving the objective of public policy; and **secondly**, analyst modifies, changes, adjust, and reconstruct new alternative more compatible to the policy problem analyzed. Meanwhile, according to (Athey, 1982), there are four ways taken to formulate alternative policy: (1) to maintain the running system; (2) to improve the running system; (3) to use prepackaged design; and (4) to create new design: idealized design, parallel situationor morpological design.

The term *pelayanan* (service) derives from Indonesian word "*layan*" meaning helping provide anything needed by others for the act of serving. Basically, every human being needs service and even extremely it can be said that service is inseparable from human life (Sinambela, 2010).

Meanwhile, the term *public* (Indonesian) derives from English word *public* meaning, general society or state. The word *publik*has actually been acceptable to be standardized Indonesian meaning general society or crowd. Some practitioners have defined public service. Agung kurniawan (2005) defines public service as giving service (serving) the need of others or community having interest in the organization according to basic rule and procedure specified.

Referring to equilibrium model theory (Riggs; 1980), the change of ecosystem components encourages the shift in subsystems of policy ecosystem to achieve new equilibrium. New equilibrium of educational service policy during Covid-19 pandemic transition period is different from that in pandemic period and of course different from that in post-pandemic time.

The formulation of learning policy is designed with formal legal power of the governmental authority. Not only it results from partial creation of individual school institutions, or moreover limited to the personal educator or teacher. But the formulation of policy summarizes experiences as both strength and weakness. On the other hand, the change of educational realm or environment is so complex. It includes global competition and science and technology development, lifestyle changing trend, and industry growth direction. Strategic environment of educational realm can be either opportunity or threat.

The formulation of policy strategy combines the identification of internal environment, including strength and weakness, and opportunity and threat coming from external environmental variable. This research puts the concept of policy formulation onto education service structure at primary education level. Parasuraman, Zaitaml, and Berry (1984) explain service dimensions including, among others: 1) tangible; (2) reliability; (3) responsiveness; (4) assurance; and (5) empathy. The formulation of educational policy in the five service dimensions is the focus of current research.

The locus of research was Salatiga City government. Article 12 of Law Number 23 of 2014 put regency/municipal regional government onto a position with an obligation to organize primary education service, consisting of elementary school (SD) and junior high school (SMP).

In this research context, the policy strategy formulation is directed to primary education service. Service, as suggested by Parasuraman, Zaitaml and Berry (1984), has five dimensions: *tangible*, *reliability*, *responsiveness*, *assurance*, and *empathy*. This research builds on some conceptual assumptions: (1) Educational policy is studied from service concept perspective with *tangible*, *reliability*, *responsiveness*, *assurance* and *empathy* dimension variables; (2) primary education service is the Elementary School (SD) and Junior High School (SMP) learning; and (3) learning concept is conceived as policy process (David Easton in Rian Nugroho, 2008), measured using *inputs*, *process conversion*, and *outputs* variables.

METHOD

The sampling procedure the author should consider, according to Eriyanto (1999) consists of: (1) topic of research. The substance of topic or research question leads to who (the population) the target of survey is; (2) population is the target of survey on topic or question posed; (3) target population is specification or attribute requiring that the population should actually lead to survey topic or question; (4) sample framework is the list of target population names. Sample framework is used to ensure that all members of target population have equal probability of being the sample; and (5) sample derives from sample framework following randomization process.

Considering this, this research conducts an analysis on the implementation of learning policy during Covid-19 pandemic to provide an alternative strategy of learning policy post-pandemic. This research was conducted on primary education institution (elementary school or SD) and junior high school (SMP).

The subject of data used in this research was the actors of education service, consisting of regional government authority in education field, in this case Education and Culture Service Office of Salatiga City, Central Java, Indonesia and Elementary School/Junior High School Organizing Unit including headmasters and teachers. The sample of research was taken using purposive sampling technique by considering the area distribution. The size of sample consisted of 15 elementary schools and 8 junior high schools. The total sample consisted of 23 educational service organizer units or schools.

Technique of collecting data used was face-to-face interview referring to the list of open-ended questionnaires from some close-ended questions. Documentation was also used as technique of collecting data to record secondary data to support or to substitute the primary data. Meanwhile, observation technique was intended to validate the necessary data. Analysis was conducted using Huberman et al.'s interactive model of analysis (2014).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Education service policy is measured using reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy, and tangible dimension. The result of research can be described as follows: **Reliability**

Reliability dimension of primary education is the stakeholder's commitment to provide the promised service

appropriately and credibility, particularly in providing primary education service timely as scheduled or promised without error in blended (face-to-face and online) learning in Salatiga City. A very high quality education should be organized. There are high enthusiasm and commitment to organize face-to-face learning immediately (including preparation, process, and end result of face to face learning, and evaluation). There are five indicators used in measuring the reliability of primary education service during Covid-19 pandemic. The result of research based on the indicator of reliability used is elaborated below.

- 1. Regulation of learning in pandemic time, socialization of regulation, implementation of regulation, compliance and support, and facility and infrastructure availability. Data of research result shows that:
 - Regulation and policy enacted in Salatiga City including preparation, socialization, and faceto-face learning implementation run well. Support and commitment of educational stakeholders are adequate and so is the availability of health protocol facilities at school.
 - (2) Education service office supervises the implementation of regulation socialized frequently. Supervision, monitoring, and evaluation are conducted through direct visit, face-to-face meeting and social media like zoom meeting and WA Group.
 - (3) Media used most frequently for socialization are *Whatsapp*, *Zoom* and face-to-face meeting. The essence of regulation released by Educational Service Office of Salatiga City is that face-to-face learning is held with maximally 50% of students and tight health protocol.
- 2. Teachers' ability of combining face-to-face learning method and long distance learning is measured through the implementation of learning training output they have attended. The data of research on the implementation of learning training during pandemic time by teachers shows that:
 - (1) All parties, including teacher and headmaster have attended socialization and training on long distance learning or face-to-face learning methods.
 - (2) Most teachers have had long distance and blended learning abilities.
 - (3) Some teachers are willing and still learning. They find a little constraint related to their old age (less IT-literate, no facility and infrastructure are owned yet, school's inadequate support and bad signal).

- 3. The supporting infrastructure of online learning implementation is measured from: the availability of laptop and android smartphone sets, teachers' and students' access to internet network, teachers' and students' ability of using information technology equipments. The data of research indicates that:
 - (1) Nearly all teachers have a limited computer/smartphone operating ability to support long distance learning.
 - (2) Teachers belonging to "fluent" category in IT utilization have been very dominant in teaching-learning activity.
 - (3) WhatApp is the most popular application to support long distance learning. Some teachers hold limited meeting with study group directly using Zoom meeting dan Google Classroom applications.
 - (4) Limited frequency of online meeting between teachers and study group is more due to students' internal factor.
 - (5) The connectivity of internet is good at school. In this case, all schools have subscribed to internet access to support teaching-learning activity.
 - (6) All students have been able to use long-distance learning equipments. Nearly 90% of junior high school (SMP) students have good ability. However, IT mastery ability is only enough to support long distance learning, thus much lower than fluent category.
 - (7) The constraint related to the limited IT mastery ability in students is on average related to the good standard of equipment (smartphone/computer) ownership.

Considering the data of research result on thereliability dimension of educational service during pandemic time in Salatiga, the ideas of educational service policy can be delivered as follows: (1) internet and cellular data connectivity has been very good in general, but sometimes trouble occurs related to bad signal and it often disturbs teaching-learning process; (2) Teachers and school have adequate IT equipments, and all teachers have good computer and smartphone equipments; (3) students' computer ownership is still low, because the students rely on smartphone for learning process on average; (4) a substantial number of students have no smartphone, thus such solutions like gadget borrowing or aid are very desirable in long distance learning; and (5) communication should be maintained between the parties for the sake of a smooth and sustainable learning process.

Responsiveness

Responsiveness is the quick response to problem to achieve learning output expected or the wish to help give primary education service needed by the parties quickly and immediately in the learning implementation during Covid-19 pandemic in Salatiga City. The indicators used related to learning management are planning, implementation, and evaluation. Data of research finding is explained as follows:

- 1. Nearly all teachers have prepared teaching-learning activity plan, including weekly face-to-face learning.
- 2. Limited learning time makes the assessment is conducted less maximally or less optimally on the face-to-face teaching-learning activity (perhaps due to limited quota).
- 3. Inadequate facility and infrastructure, and uneven gadget (smartphone) ownership result in the constraint in the long distance learning criteria.
- 4. Educational Service Office of Salatiga supervises the implementation of teaching-learning activity frequently during pandemic. Supervision and evaluation are conducted through direct visit and holding direct meeting and zoom meeting and Whatsapp group (WAG).

Considering the data of research findings on responsiveness dimension, the idea of educational service policy in Salatiga City can be expressed as follows: (1)The problem related to very low teaching time sufficiency encourages the use of essential basic competency (because the use of online method with limited time and quota affects significantly the financial condition of student's parent); (2) Material is delivered briefly to fulfill the essential basic competency for the students. It worryingly will affect the students' ability of comprehending the teaching material delivered. The material should be prepared varyingly and comprehensively, according to the target of teaching-learning activity with the attractive visualization for the students; (3) online learning curriculum for students should be developed including sufficient material, time, process, and outcome to be achieved in the online learning; and (4) school should conduct monitoring and evaluation on face to face learning routinely, and report the performance of teaching-learning activity, in relation to students' competency, medical screening and learning process development conducted.

Assurance

Assurance or the guarantee of educational service quality is defined as the implementation of learning during pandemic directed to achieve the learning outcome in the form of minimum mastery criteria by minimizing covid-19 suspect incidence (the guarantee of students' health and smooth learning activity). The indicator used to measure *assurance* dimension is the anxiety related to potential health problems in the learning implementation, the achievement of minimum mastery criteria in online learning (in the period of January-June 2021), perceived quality of learning during covid-19 pandemic, and excess of learning implementation during Covid-19 pandemic. Data collected based on the indicators of assurance is explained below.

- 1. Such anxiety has subsided or almost no anxiety arises. Medical screening and almost 100% vaccination are the strong reason for implementing face-to-face learning, despite tight health protocol to prevent Covid-19 transmission.
- 2. Students often respond to the online learning less maximally than they do to the offline one. Students have low motivation to attend long distance learning because they have not been ready yet for this pandemic condition and situation. Students tend to have lower competency and ability in absorbing the teaching material.
- 3. Students tend to do the quiz haphazardly. It is difficult to control them directly and to measure students' ability and comprehension.
- 4. Absolute answer to this question is that face-to-face learning is purely better than either blended or online learning. In online learning, students' mark may be better. But their basic competency and problem solving ability are lower. Moral and norm aspects also become important concentration to the school management.
- 5. In SMPN 10 there are 2 students preferring to get married in early age. Some others prefer not attending any school activity at all, either online or offline. It is because, according to the headmaster, there is no time for learning activity. Other schools also worry about the juvenile delinquency incidence.

Considering the data of research finding on assurance dimension, the idea of educational service policy in Salatiga City is elaborated as follows: (1) implementation of legality & document policy, preparing appropriate regulation and all documents of teaching process well including ppt, video, recording, and other materials, checking the completeness before beginning the learning, and completing the incomplete one according to the curriculum enacted; (2) human resource fulfillment, the fulfillment of instructor and teaching staff's need through fulfilling the need, correcting the weakness existing by improving human resource competency, particularly in informatics technology program or application, skill, and networking; (3) **preparing** featured program, based on experience, improving the quality of primary education during sustainable blended learning; (4) facility/infrastructure availability, the minimum standard preexisting in blended learning should be maintained, as necessary; (5) expanding partnership network, the extentto which the parties, particularly schools, establish partnership with those related through symbiosis

mutualism continuously, MOU of blended learning; (6) evaluation on implementation and quality control, conducted through monitoring, assessment, and building activities, and (7) budget/cost availability should be effective and efficient based on the school's ability, in this case in collaboration with Government (Salatiga City Government) and society or school.

Empathy

Empathy in the term of educational service is defined as policy and affirmation in facing strength and weakness of learning during pandemic in Salatiga City. The dimension of empathy is measured using the following indicators: attempts taken by teachers to solve the constraints in the implementation of online learning, attempts taken by the school to solve the constraints the students face in attending online learning, learning outcome during pandemic (January-June 2021), and the school's policy in treating the learning outcome with minimum mastery criteria. The data of research finding on empathy dimension is as elaborated as follows:

- 1. Trainingfor teachers has ever been provided frequently. Teaching-learning process using home visit method has also been conducted for the students with poor mark (score), having difficulty in online learning, and attending the long-distance learning inactively.
- 2. The uneven ownership of gadget or smartphone makes the long distance learning not maximal. Signal and internet quota often generate some problem. Thus, students' motivation and willingness to participate actively in long distance learning decline as well.
- 3. Teachers cannot control directly the students' learning ability. The scores obtained from online assignment is putatively not purely the result of students' learning. Some parties (parent, tutor) may help them; this makes the assessment of learning outcome biased. This also lowers the quality of assignment done by students.
- 4. Supporting facilities have been attempted and provided by the schools to students and teachers needing.
- 5. Learning outcome is less satisfactory because of the less maximal learning implementation. The essential basic competency has been helpful but in fact is still inadequate to students' knowledge and competency development. Very limited time allocated to face-toface learning is one of factor leading to the students' poor learning outcome.
- 6. The percentage of minimum mastery criteria achievement belonging to very good category is very low. Remedial or additional assignment often

needs to be given to achieve the minimum mastery criteria.

- 7. The proportion of minimum mastery criteria belonging to "good" category still dominates. However, remedial or additional assignment often needs to be given to achieve minimum mastery criteria.
- 8. The students' learning outcome belonging to poor minimum mastery criteria reaches 10%, on average.
- 9. Remedial and additional assignment constitutes a solution to students in fulfilling the minimum mastery criteria.

Considering the data of research finding on empathy dimension, the idea of educational service policy in Salatiga city can be delivered as follows: the need for socialization, facilitation implementation, and training for the school management in the implementation of blended learning. For the minimum mastery criteria of learning outcome to be optimum, the Salatiga City government should give support through APBD (Regional Income and Budget Expense) and learning program activity, particularly in the regions with bad signal, monitoring, evaluation, and special attention.

Tangible

Tangible is the dimension of service that can be sensed physically. This research uses operational definition of tangible dimension as the physical infrastructure and appearance of school in the learning process during pandemic in Salatiga City. The indicator of tangible dimension used is the well-maintained infrastructure and suprastructure of school, cleanliness, safety, access to school library, and online learning source availability. The data of research related to the indicator of tangible indicator is elaborated as follows:

- 1. Health protocol facilities have been provided very well and adequately
- 2. *Peduli Lindungi* application is used by few schools only. In-depth socialization should be given related to the effectiveness and function of the application. It is reasonable that schools do not use *Peduli Lindungi* application, because Governmental service offices in Salatiga, like Educational Service Office and Local Legislative Assembly (DPRD) office do not use this application to track the guest coming. Documentation applied in school and educational service office is limited to the filling of guest book only.
- 3. School citizens have obeyed the health protocol well
- 4. Body temperature checking is conducted in all schools being the sample.
- 5. The role of teacher in school environment becomes important to remind the students to comply with health protocol.

- 6. Digital library has not been used like that at University level. Innovation should be applied to this immediately.
- 7. The availability of teaching material is considered as sufficient digitally. Pandemic becomes milestone to create teaching materialdigitally. The optimization of digital teaching material quality should be studied and improved.
- 8. It has been adequate in few schools, but still limited in many others.
- 9. Reading culture should be developed through socialization, e-library, manual e-library, reading habit, and the establishment of literature center at regional governmental level, in this case Salatiga City Government.

Considering the data of research finding on tangible dimension, the idea of educational service policy in Salatiga City can be elaborated as follows: **learning facilities and infrastructure should be prepared well, planning, budgeting and learning implementation** will help the existing smooth process, including server, computer and laptop, internet subscription, institutional and network collaboration, e-learning material and digital library at Regional level. In addition, human resource's preparedness for technology transfer in learning and support from many parties are very desirable. It is noteworthy that this **blended learning will be learning method in the future.** Early preparedness is required related to the concept of freedom to learn (*merdeka belajar*).

The result of data analysis in the research on the implementation of learning in pandemic time in Salatiga City identifies some arguments about factors supporting and inhibiting the implementation of learning material in schools. The learning implementation during pandemic in Salatiga City finds supporting factors or strengths including: (1) students will learn the teaching material freely and independently, as the material is provided online; (2) teacher and students can hold discussion beyond face-to-face hour; (3) the activities beyond face-to-face hour can be managed and controlled well by instructor; (4) learning becomes more effective and efficient, particularly in the term of providing assignment, feedback, and evaluation result through internet media; (5) students can share file with each other; (6) instructor can add enrichment material; and (7) reporting and monitoring can be done by the parties (Educational Service Office and schools) more practically because internet link has been established to see the result of learning activity.

Meanwhile, the identification of **inhibiting factors or weaknesses shows**, among others: (1) the media needed are so varying that it is difficult to apply if no supporting facility and infrastructure is available; (2) uneven ownership of facilities by pupil and college students, including computer and internet access. Meanwhile in blended learning, adequate internet access is required, because the less adequate network will make students find difficulty in attending independent learning online; (3) people's poor knowledge on technology use; (4) teacher should have skill of organizing e-learning; (5) teacher should allocate time to develop and to manage elearning system (e.g. developing material, preparing assessment, doing assessment, and answering or giving statement in the forum held by the students); (6) teacher should prepare digital reference as the reference for the students and digital reference integrated into face-to-face learning; (7) teacher needs learning strategy to maximize the potential learning during pandemic, and (8) Regional government should allocate additional budget to facilitate the blended learning implementation through Regional Income and Expense Budget (APBD) or along with central government through legitimate funding based on the relevant regulation.

Recommendation and formulation of policy based on gap analysis and solution given by the related parties to post-Covid-19 pandemic policy in Salatiga are elaborated below:

- 1. *To teacher and instructor*, (1) the result of current research can be reference to teacher and students in implementing blended learning and to parents in supporting the learning implementation, and (2) to online learning during Covid-19 pandemic, the teachers should find innovative solution and think creatively to make the learning process keep running at school without face-to-face activity.
- 2. *To the schools*, preparation should be made related to facilities and infrastructures, competent teacher, internal supervision and building in online learning, the achievement of minimum mastery criteria score by students and independent funding.
- 3. *To Regional Government*, appropriate policy and regulation are required, and so are the fund from APBD of Salatiga City and evaluation and monitoring on the learning implementation based on educational standard in achieving the objective of education.
- 4. National standardized learning facilities and infrastructures should be completed, attention should be paid to internet connection, competency of teacher and teaching staff should be improved by (1) equipping them with IT skill and establishing cooperation among the parties including Regional Government, School, teacher, and community in a good learning process, (2) preparing facilities and infrastructure, learning plan, periodical supervision and building related to the achievement of learning objective in pandemic era and the achievement and implementation of teaching curriculum and process more optimally, (3) preparation in the achievement of better minimum mastery criteria by implementing blended learning to students,

approaching the students more intensively and establishing collaboration with students' parents (guardian) to do supervision at home. The achievement of minimum mastery criteria should be optimized, and supervision and building should be intensified by the p arties, and (4) Regional government should paid attention to literacy development, human resource budgeting facilities improvement, for and infrastructures and others in the smooth implementation of blended learning process in Salatiga city toward an elearning -based independent learning and freedom to learn in the future.

CONCLUSION

Learning process and primary education service in Salatiga is required to be organized well either virtually (online) or offline (face-to-face) according to the regulation published by the government in post-Covid-19 New Normal era. However, some constraints are still found so that the both of them cannot be implemented all at once. Alternative strategy of educational service policy improves the strength of face-to-face learning model before pandemic with the input of learning instrument developed during pandemic. This educational service strategy combines previous (face-toface) learning system and non-face-to-face (e-learning) system. The combination of both systems aims to improve the conception and to develop computerized skill or IT technique. Not only is the expansion of learning source limited to the domination of teachers' role. But learning source can also derive from broader information technology-based internet with more varying packaging. The standardization of school's role is conducted dynamically building on science and technology development.

REFERENCES

- Akhlaghi, E., Amini, S., & Akhlaghi, H. 2012. Evaluating educational service quality in technical and vocational colleges using SERVQUAL Model. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 46(4), 5285-5289.
- Adi Kumastuti dan Ahmad Mustamil Khoiron, 2019. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*, Lembaga Pendidikan Sukarno Pressindo.
- Asmuni (2020) Problematika pembelajaran daring di masa pandemic covid – 19 dan solusi pemecahannya, Jurnal Paedagogy Jurnal Penelitian dan Pengembangan Pendidikan Vol 7 Nomer 4, pp 281 - 288
- 4. Bielawski, L & Metcalf, D. 2003. *Blended eLearning: Integrating Knowledge, Performance Support, and Online Learning*. Amherst, MA: HRD Press.

- Bramasta, D. B. 2020. Mengenal Apa itu New Normal di Tengah Pandemi Corona ... Retrieved February 22, 2021, from https://www.kompas.com/tren/read/2020/05/20/063 100865/mengenal-apa-itu-new-normal-di-tengahpandemi-corona
- Dede, Yahya. 2011.Perkembangan TIK di Bidang Pendidikan. (Online), (http://dedeyahya.com/2011/10/perkembangan-tikdi-bidang-pendidikan.html). diakses pada 26 desember 2013.
- Dwiyogo, Wasis D. 2010.*Pembelajaran Blended Learning*. (Online), (http://id.wikibooks.org/wiki/Pembelajaran_Berbas is_Blended_Learning). diakses pada 13 maret 2013.
- 8. Faizah, A. 2020. Pembelajaran yang Ideal di Era New Normal.
- 9. Fathurrahman & Nuthpaturahman. 2015. *Blended Learning*. Banjarmasin.
- Handoko & Waskito. 2018. Blended Learning: Teori dan Penerapannya. Padang: Lembaga Pengembangan Teknologi Informasi dan Komunikasi (LPTIK) Universitas Andalas.
- 11. Hardani, dkk, 2020, *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif dan Kuntitatif*, Pustaka Ilmu.
- 12. Heri, D. 2020. Menyiapkan Pembelajaran dalam Memasuki "New Normal" dengan Blended Learning. Retrieved February 22, 2021, from http://lpmplampung.kemdikbud.go.id/pocontent/upl oads/New_Normal_Blended_Learning_artikel_sec. pdf
- 13. Husamah. 2014. *Pembelajaran Bauran (Blended Learning)*. Prestasi Pustaka Publisher
- Hanggara, F. D., Sugiono, S., & Efranto, R. Y. 2014. Analisis Kualitas Layana berbasis Servqual Terintegrasi dengan Metoda QFD. *Jurnal Rekayasa dan Manajemen Sistem Industri*, 2(4), 809-819.
- Heizer, J., & Render, B. 2009. Operation Management (Manajemen Operasi) Education, Inc – Salemba Empat, Jakarta.
- Kusairi, Sentot. 2011. Implementasi Blended Learning. Makalah disajikan dalam Seminar Nasional Pengembangan Pembelajaran Berbasis Blended learning. Jurusan Biologi FMIPA UM, Malang, 10 Januari 2012.
- 17. Kotler, P., & Keller, K. L. 2016. *Manajemen Pemasaran*. Pearson Education, Inc t PT. Indeks, Jakarta
- Kusni, M. 2010. Implementasi Sistem Pembelajaran Blended Learning pada Matakuliah AE3121 GetaranMekanik di Program Aeronotika dan Astonotika, Seminar Tahunan Teknik Mesin
- 19. Sallis, E. 2012. *Total Quality Management in Education*. IRCiSod t Yogyakarta

- 20. Sudijono, Anas. 2011. Pengantar Statistik Pendidikan. Jakarta: PT. Raja Garfindo Persada
- 21. Tabor, S. 2007. Narrowing the distance: Implementing a hybrid learning model for information security education. The Quarterly Review.
- 22. Tjiptono, F., & Chandra, G. 2016. *Service, Quality* dan*Satisfaction* : Edisi 4. Andi, Yogyakarta
- Wulandari, S. H. E., & Ciptomulyono, U. 2011. Strategi Peningkatan Kualitas Layanan Pendidikan menggunakan integrasi Metode fuzzy servqual dan QFD. Jurnal Magister Manajemen Teknik Industri ITS: Surabaya. 2(3), 20-32.
- 24. Jurnal Penelitian dan Pengembangan Pendidikan http://ojs.ikipmataram.ac.id/index.php/pedagogy/in dex Oktober 2020. Vol. 7 No. 4 p-ISSN: 2355-7761 e-ISSN: 2722-4627 pp. 281-288
- 25. Anderson, James E. 1979. Public Policy Making. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Cochran, Charles L. & Eloise F.Malone. 1995. Public Policy: Perspectives and Choices. New York: Me Graw-Hill, Inc.
- 27. Cooper, Phillip J. et al. 1998. Public Administration for the Twenty-First Century. Fort Worth: Harcourt Brace College Publishers.
- Denhardt, Janet V. & Robert B.Denhardt. 2003. The New Public Service: Serving, not Steering. Armonk: M.E.Sharpe
- 29. Dye, Thomas R. 1978. Understanding Public Policy. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice - Hall, Inc.
- Gerston, Larry N. 2002. Public Policy Making in a Democratic Society. Armonk: M.E. Sharpe.
- Gosling, James J. 2004. Understanding, Informing, and Appraising Public Policy. New York: Pearson Longman.
- 32. Hogwood, Brian W. & Lewis A.Gunn. 1984. Policy Analysis for the Real World. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- 33. Islamy, M.I. 2007. Prinsip-Prinsip Perumusan Kebijaksanaan Negara. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Jenkins, Williams J. 1978. PolicyAnalysis: A Political and Organizational Perspective. London: Martin Robertson.
- 35. Lantz, Paula. (tanpa tahun). Academy Role in Public Policies in Health Care. University of Michigan.
- Lester, Lames V. & Joseph Stewart, Jr. 2000. Public Policy: An Evolutionary Approach. Australia: Wadsworth.
- Dun, N William (1994) Public Policy Analysis, an introduction, Prentice – hall, Inc., A Simon & Schuster company Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey 07632, All Rights Reserved

- Bryson, John M. 2004. Strategic Planning for Public and Nonprofit Organization 3rd Edition. San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass.
- 39. Finanti, Elina Dyah dan Marzuki (2021), Cooperative Learning Strategies in Citizenship Education Subject in Elementary Schools During the Pandemic Covid-19, Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan (JIP)Vol. 27, Issue 1, June 2021, pp. 34-40.
- 40. Hockly, N. (2012). Substitute or redefine? Modern English Teacher, 21(3), 40–42.
- 41. Lin, M. H., Chen, H. C., & Liu, K. S. (2017). A study of the effects of digital learning on learning motivation and learning outcome. Eurasia: Journal of Mathematics Science and Technol-Ogy Education, 13(7), 3553–3564. https://doi.org/10.129-73/eurasia.2017.00744a

42. https://www.google.com/search?q=kelebihan+pem belajaran+tatap+muka&sxsrf=AOaemvJq2Vom17 RYswZWqubV3TKTgjXJIA%3A1632659050117 &ei=amZQYaLCBo_49QOr2qrQBA&oq=kelebiha n+pembelajaran+tata&gs_lcp=Cgdnd3Mtd2l6

- 43. http://repository.unpas.ac.id/49443/6/BAB%20II.p df
- 44. https://repository.usm.ac.id/files/skripsi/F11A/2015 /F.111.15.0038/F.111.15.0038-05-BAB-II-20190306035757.pdf
- 45. https://repository.uinsuska.ac.id/4070/3/BAB%20II.pdf
- https://www.google.com/search?q=teori+kebijakan +publik&oq=teori+kebijakan&aqs=chrome.1.69i57 j0i512l9.12926j0j15&sourceid=chrome&ie=UTF-8
- 47. https://www.kemdikbud.go.id/main/blog/2020/05/k emendikbud-terbitkan-pedoman-penyelenggaraanbelajar-dari-rumah
- https://metro.tempo.co/read/1391861/dampaknegatif-dan-positif-pembelajaran-jarak-jauhselama-pandemi-covid-19
- 49. https://home.matematika.upi.edu/id/dampakpositif-pembelajaran-jarak-jauh-oleh-aulia-alifeiramunandar-matematika-fpmipa-upi/